

MATTHEW M. LAVIN (*pro hac vice*)
Matt.lavin@agg.com
AARON R. MODIANO (*pro hac vice*)
Aaron.modiano@agg.com
ARNALL GOLDEN GREGORY LLP
1775 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Suite 1000
Washington, DC 20006
Telephone: (202) 677-4030
Facsimile: (202) 677-4031

DAVID LILIENSTEIN, SBN 218923
david@dlawgroup.com
KATIE SPIELMAN, SBN 252209
katie@dlawgroup.com
DL LAW GROUP
345 Franklin Street
San Francisco, CA 94102
Telephone: (415) 678-5050
Fax: (415) 358-8484

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
OAKLAND DIVISION

LD, DB, BW, RH and CJ on behalf of themselves and all others similarly situated,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

UNITED HEALTHCARE INSURANCE COMPANY, a Connecticut corporation, UNITED BEHAVIORAL HEALTH, INC. a California corporation, and MULTIPLAN, INC., a New York corporation,

Defendants.

Case No.: 4:20-CV-02254-YGR-JCS

Hon. Yvonne Gonzalez Rogers

**PLAINTIFFS' SUPPLEMENTAL
RESPONSE TO ORDER GRANTING IN
PART DEFENDANTS' RENEWED
ADMINISTRATIVE MOTION TO SEAL**

In its Order Granting in Part Defendants’ Renewed Administrative Motion to Seal (the “Order”) [dkt. 352], the Court denied a number of Defendants United Health Insurance Company, United Behavioral Health, Inc., and Multiplan, Inc.’s (collectively, the “Defendants”) requests to seal certain documents or portions of thereof included in the Renewed Administrative Motion to File Under Seal [dkt. 305]. Accordingly, for those documents where the Court denied Defendants’ requests to seal either in whole or in part, Plaintiffs LD, DB, BW, RH, and CJ (the “Plaintiffs”) submit the following corrected, redacted exhibits consistent with the Order. Please see chart below. Plaintiffs reserve the right to request administrative relief, and all other relief necessary, to the extent the Defendants’ response to the Order includes new information.

Exhibit	Document or Portion of Document Sought to be Sealed	Ruling
1	Exhibit 71 to the Declaration of Rebecca Paradise (Dkt. 208-1), communications to UHC plan sponsor account teams.	Denied.
2	Exhibit 179 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-8), named plaintiff BW’s supplemental response to UBH’s first set of interrogatories, dated July 15, 2022.	Denied as overbroad.
3	Exhibit 180 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-8), named plaintiff RH’s supplemental response to UBH’s first set of interrogatories, dated July 15, 2022.	Denied as overbroad.
4	Exhibit 181 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-9), named plaintiff LD’s supplemental response to UBH’s first set of interrogatories, dated July 15, 2022.	Denied as overbroad.

5	Exhibit 182 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-9), named plaintiff DB's supplemental response to UBH's first set of interrogatories, dated July 15, 2022.	Denied as overbroad.
6	Exhibit 183 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-9), named plaintiff CJ's supplemental response to UBH's first set of interrogatories, dated July 15, 2022.	Denied as overbroad.
7	Portions of Exhibit 184 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-9), a transcript of the September 26, 2022 deposition of Plaintiffs' proposed expert, Dr. Robert L. Ohsfeldt, 83:7-87:20; 88:18-89:19; 92:2-12; 92:15-93:10; 94:2-96:12; 97:15-98:17; 99:2-19; 107:4-108:16; 113:21-116:17; 118:24-120:4; 122:4-125:4; 128:16-19; 128:21-129:23; 133:1-136:1; 161:2-162:24; 163:4-164:6; 198:17-200:13; 203:15-204:25.	Granted as to the specified citations only.
8	Exhibit 210 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-11), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Ocean Breeze Recovery as an audio file bates numbered OBR000089.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
9	Exhibit 211 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Ocean Breeze Recovery as an audio file bates numbered OBR000090.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
10	Exhibit 212 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Ocean Breeze Recovery as an audio file bates numbered OBR000091.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
11	Exhibit 213 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Ocean Breeze Recovery as an audio file bates numbered OBR000092.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
12	Exhibit 214 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service,	Granted as to PHI/PII only.

	vice, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Ocean Breeze Recovery as an audio file bates numbered OBR000093.	
13	Exhibit 215 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000102.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
14	Exhibit 216 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000103.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
15	Exhibit 217 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000104.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
16	Exhibit 218 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000105.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
17	Exhibit 219 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000106.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
18	Exhibit 220 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-12), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000107.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
19	Exhibit 221 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209- 13), transcript by the court reporting	Granted as to PHI/PII only.

	service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000108.	
20	Exhibit 222 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-13), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000109.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
21	Exhibit 223 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-13), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000110.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
22	Exhibit 224 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-13), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party Pathway to Hope as an audio file bates numbered PTH000111.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
23	Exhibit 225 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-13), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party PCI West Lake as an audio file bates numbered CSVOB225.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
24	Exhibit 226 to the Declaration of Geoffrey Sigler (Dkt. 209-13), transcript by the court reporting service, Veritext, of a call recording separately produced by third party PCI West Lake as an audio file bates numbered JMVOB224.	Granted as to PHI/PII only.
25	Excerpts from the Declaration of Kathleen Praxmarer (Dkt. 212), ¶¶ 9–17.	Denied as to ¶¶ 9, 10, and 14. Otherwise granted, <i>but see, supra, n.1.</i>
26	Exhibit 17 to the Compendium (Dkt. 210-2), transcripts of call recordings produced by Ocean Breeze Recovery Center in response to a subpoena issued by the United Defendants in this action and transcribed by Veritext, bates numbered OBR000089–93.	Granted as to PHI/PII.
27	Exhibit 24 to the Compendium (Dkt. 210-3), transcripts of call recordings produced by Pathway to Hope in response to a subpoena issued by the	Granted as to PHI/PII.

	United Defendants in this action and transcribed by Veritext, bates numbered PTH000102–111.	
28	Exhibit 26 to the Compendium (Dkt. 210-3), transcripts of call recordings produced by PCI West Lake Center in response to a subpoena issued by the United Defendants in this action and transcribed by Veritext, bates numbered CS VOB 225 and JM VOB 224.	Granted as to PHI/PII.
29	Exhibit 38 to the Compendium (Dkt. 210-4), an email between Matthew Aiken and employees of Stepping Stone of San Diego.	Denied except as to PHI/PII.
30	Expert Report of Daniel Kessler and accompanying exhibits (Dkt. 213).	Denied as overbroad.
31	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 2, the Declaration of Thomas P. Ralston (Dkt. 251-4), ¶¶ 4-30, Exhibit A.	Denied as to ¶¶ 4 and 7, otherwise granted.
32	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 3, Deposition transcript of Rebecca Paradise (Dkt. 251-6), in full, or in the alternative as follows—Volume 1:73:12–78:25, 160:20–163:25 179:6–182:2; Volume 2:104:22–106:4; 229:17–232:2	Granted as to the alternative, narrower request only.
33	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 4, Deposition Transcript of Sarah Peterson (Dkt. 251-8), in full, or in the alternative as follows—126:2-7, 176:13-16	Granted as to the narrower request, otherwise denied.
34	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 5, Deposition Transcript of Radames Lopez (Dkt. 251-10), in full, or in the alternative, as follows—76:1– 85:15, 81:11–90:19, 103:18– 110:17, 149:21–151:4, 161:20– 167:19, 292:22–294:1.	Granted as to the narrower request with the exception of 89:1-22 and 167:12-19.
35	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 6, Deposition Transcript of Jolene Bradley (Dkt. 251-12), in full, or in the alternative, as follows— 135:12-25.	Granted as to the narrower request.
36	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 11, Deposition Transcript of Sean Crandell (Dkt. 251-22). Specifically, and as identified in MultiPlan's confidentiality designations pursuant to the Protective Order: 25:19-22; 31:3-37:24; 39:6-40:7; 40:16-42:8; 43:7-46:15; 46:20- 50:23; 51:10-53:4;	Granted except as to 76:4-6.

	53:15-54:24; 55:14-21; 56:14-59:5; 59:11-23; 63:16-64:9; 64:14-66:3; 68:17-69:18; 72:9-74:22; 75:1-15; 76:4-6; 76:19-78:2; 78:11-79:23; 80:5-21; 81:4-82:13; 82:17-84:8; 85:11-22; 86:3-13; 87:11-20; 87:24-89:11; 89:24-90:8; 90:20-93:13; 94:11-95:22; 97:10-98:19; 99:3-4; 99:6-8; 99:11-100:10; 101:1-4; 101:7-102:15; 103:18-105:6; 105:14-107:6; 107:19-108:18; 114:6-117:20; 117:23-120:13; 120:18-122:15; 122:18-20; 122:22-125:1; 125:17-126:8; 126:17-127:17; 127:21-128:4; 132:3-133:2; 133:7-17; 133:19-134:3; 134:10-18; 134:22-135:6; 135:8-20; 135:22-136:3; 136:10-137:6; 137:8-16; 138:5-140:1.	
37	Plaintiffs' Exhibit 42, Deposition Transcript of Denise Strait (Dkt. 259-17), in full, or in the alternative, as follows— 64:22-25, 159:7-186:21, 193:16-204:6	Granted as to the narrower, alternative request.
38	Excerpts from Exhibit M to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification – Excerpts from the July 14, 2022 deposition of MultiPlan's Vice President of Healthcare Economics, Sean Crandell. Specifically, and as identified in MultiPlan's confidentiality designations pursuant to the Protective Order: 66:1-3; 68:17-24; 90:20-24; 91:1-24; 94:11-24; 95:1-22; 114:6-24; 115:1-24; 116:1-24; 125:17-24; 127:21-24; 136:10-24.	Granted but denied as to 66:1-3 and 68:17-24.
39	Excerpts from Exhibit S to Plaintiffs' Motion for Class Certification- Excerpts from the July 12, 2022 deposition of MultiPlan's Senior Vice President of Sales and Account Management, Jacqueline Kienzle. Specifically, and as identified in MultiPlan's confidentiality designations pursuant to the Protective Order: 95:14-25; 102:1-13; 136:1; 196:22-25; 197:1-25; 273:1-25.	Granted but denied as to 136:1.

Dated: October 26, 2023

ARNALL GOLDEN GREGORY LLP

/s/ Matthew Lavin
MATTHEW M. LAVIN

DL LAW GROUP

/s/ David Lilienstein

David Lilienstein

Attorneys for Plaintiffs